Survey of Cities

A s part of the best practices reviews on e-government and managing local computer systems, the Office of the Legislative Auditor surveyed 521out of Minnesota's 854 cities. The aggregate results of cities' responses are available here. Survey results from Minnesota counties and school districts are also available on our Web site.

Who was Surveyed and How Many Responded

To achieve a representative sample of cities, we grouped all of them by geographic area and by size, and then we randomly selected samples of cities from within each of the subgroups. The October 2001 survey went to information technology managers in the randomly selected cities or to city managers, administrators, or clerk-treasurers when we did not have the name of a technology contact. Participants had an option of responding on-line or using the paper questionnaire. We received responses from 429 cities for a response rate of 82 percent. The margin of error for the city survey is plus or minus 3 percentage points. Additional information on survey methodology is in Appendix A of both reports.

Notes on Survey Results

Of the 32 questions on the survey, 2 applied to the computer systems that cities had in place and how they were maintained. Viewers interested in those answers should look at questions 3 and 4 on the survey. All remaining questions pertained to e-government.

In analyzing the results, it became necessary to exclude certain incongruous answers from a small number of respondents. As an example, for question 3 we report the number indicating that their computer systems were fully or partially networked, but we include in this number only those who indicated that they had personal computers or workstations in use. Some reported that their computers were networked even though they reported they had no PCs. Although we were able to clarify some responses by telephoning the respondents, we excluded a few that were not clarified. In addition, some city respondents said they used a computer owned not by the city, but by the clerk or some other official; we included them among those responding affirmatively to question 3 on use of computers, but we excluded them from other analyses.



Minnesota Office of the Legislative Auditor SURVEY ON E-GOVERNMENT

Thank you for answering this survey on electronic government, which is part of a study on best practices in local e-government around Minnesota. For this study,

"E-government" is defined as: information or transactions provided on-line by governments to their citizens using the Internet and Web sites; it does not include government-to-business interactions, such as on-line procurement systems. Nor does this survey cover "intranets" used for agencies' internal information and communication. E-government examples range from posting board minutes to registering participants to paying fees on-line.

For your information, *Minnesota Statutes* (2000) §3.978, subd. 2 gives our office authority to collect this information from public officials and requires them to respond. We will report results from the survey only in the aggregate, not by individual respondent. Upon completion of this project in spring of 2002, however, all information, including survey responses, will be public data (as defined by *Minnesota Statutes* (2000) §13.03, subd. 1) and available to the public upon request.

You have the option of completing an on-line version of this survey by following the directions on the blue sheet enclosed with this mailing. If you choose the paper survey, please return it in the postage-paid envelope by **November 6, 2001**. *Direct questions about the survey to Jody Hauer at 651/296-8501 or jody.hauer@state.mn.us.*

1. Does your city provide any information or services to citizens on-line? (Select one of the following answers.) (N=425)

Number Percent

124 29.2% 1 Yes.

47 11.1 2 No, but we will within the coming year.

- 19.8 3 No, but we would like to sometime in the future.
- 170 40.0% 4 No, we have no such plans.

2. Whether or not you currently offer e-government to citizens, how has any of the following limited your ability to offer e-government? (For each obstacle, indicate how serious it is, if at all.)

-		Very Serious <u>Obstacle</u>	Serious <u>Obstacle</u>	Moderately Serious <u>Obstacle</u>	Not an <u>Obstacle</u>
a.	Citizens indicated they are not interested in e-government. (<i>N</i> =378)	<i>N</i> =22 5.8%	<i>N</i> =27 7.1%	<i>N</i> =66 17.5%	<i>N</i> =263 69.6%
b.	Elected leaders do not view e-government as a high priority. (<i>N</i> =390)	<i>N</i> =32 8.2%	<i>N</i> =56 14.4%	<i>N</i> =96 24.6%	<i>N</i> =206 52.8%
c.	Expenses for e-government are too high given our other needs (<i>N</i> =393)	5. <i>N</i> =96 24.4%	<i>N</i> =81 20.6%	<i>N</i> =128 32.6%	<i>N</i> =88 22.4%
d.	We are not sure where to begin. (<i>N</i> =395)	<i>N</i> =37 9.4%	<i>N</i> =69 17.5%	<i>N</i> =118 29.9%	<i>N</i> =171 43.3%
e.	We do not have access to high-speed telecommunications lines, cabling, or other infrastructure. (<i>N</i> =388)	<i>N</i> =61 15.7%	<i>N</i> =41 10.6%	<i>N</i> =63 16.2%	<i>N</i> =223 57.5%
f.	We do not have the computers, software, or other necessary equipment. (<i>N</i> =400)	<i>N</i> =71 17.8%	<i>N</i> =40` 10.0%	<i>N</i> =63 15.8%	<i>N</i> =226 56.5%
g.	Staff do not have e-government background or training. (<i>N</i> =399)	<i>N</i> =85 21.3%	<i>N</i> =86 21.6%	<i>N</i> =141 35.3%	<i>N</i> =87 21.8%
h.	Not enough staff hours are available to offer e-government. (<i>N</i> =399)	<i>N</i> =124 31.1%	<i>N</i> =97 24.3%	<i>N</i> =105 26.3%	<i>N</i> =73 18.3%
i.	We are unable to keep up with rapidly changing technology. (<i>N</i> =383)	<i>N</i> =66 17.2%	<i>N</i> =82 21.4%	<i>N</i> =142 37.1%	<i>N</i> =93 24.3%
j.	Other (<i>Please specify</i> .) (N=32)	<i>N</i> =10 31.3%	<i>N</i> =5 15.6%	<i>N</i> =2 6.3%	<i>N</i> =15 46.9%

The next two questions deal with *all* of your city's computer systems—not just computers that you may use for e-government.

3. Which of the following best describes the computers currently used in your city? (*For each row indicate whether it is in use and, if applicable, part of a computer network.*)

		N for	In l	In Use		Networked			
		<u>In Use</u>	Yes	No	Networked*	Fully	Partially	None	
8.	Individual personal computers or workstations	<i>N</i> =419	<i>N</i> =372 88.8%	<i>N</i> =47 11.2%	<i>N</i> =316	<i>N</i> =112 35.4%	<i>N</i> =63 19.9%	<i>N</i> =141 44.6%	
b.	Mid-range (mini-computers) or mainframe computers	<i>N</i> =321	<i>N</i> =50 15.6%	<i>N</i> =271 84.4%	<i>N</i> =46	<i>N</i> =29 63.0%	<i>N</i> =10 21.7%	<i>N</i> =7 15.2%	
c.	File servers	<i>N</i> =333	<i>N</i> =109 32.7%	<i>N</i> =224 67.3%					

d. Other (*Please specify*.)

*Out of all those who responded that they had a computer.

4.* What arrangements does your city have for the updating, security, and daily operations of all the computer system(s) in your jurisdiction? (*Indicate the extent to which each row applies.*)

		For <i>All</i> of the Systems'	For <i>Most</i> of the Systems'	For <i>Some</i> of the Systems'	
a.	We rely on in-house staff. (<i>N</i> =336)	<i>N</i> =135 40.2%	<i>N</i> =104 31.0%	<i>N</i> =61 18.2%	<i>N</i> =36 10.7%
b.	We rely on a collaboration(s) of local governments (or a cooperative). (<i>N</i> =298)	<i>N</i> =5 1.7%	<i>N</i> =12 4.0%	<i>N</i> =37 12.4%	<i>N</i> =244 81.9%
c.	We rely on a consultant or computer-service vendor(s) for the computers we own. (<i>N</i> =330)	<i>N</i> =65 19.7%	<i>N</i> =66 20.0%	<i>N</i> =113 34.2%	<i>N</i> =86 26.1%
d.	We house computers and their applications off-site and a vendor there manages them. (<i>N</i> =295)	<i>N</i> =7 2.4%	<i>N</i> =5 1.7%	<i>N</i> =16 5.3%	<i>N</i> =267 90.5%
e.	Other. (Please specify.) (N=28)	<i>N</i> =2 7.1%	<i>N</i> =0 0.0%	<i>N</i> =4 14.3%	<i>N</i> =22 78.6%

*All Q4 Ns: N does not include respondents indicating their governments have no computers.

The following questions apply only if you already offer e-government—that is, you answered "yes" to Question 1 on page 1. *If you do not currently provide information or services to citizens on-line, you may STOP here and return the survey. Thank you.*

This next set of questions deals with *planning* for e-government.

5. Do you have a written strategic plan that includes plans for your e-government services? (Select one.) (N=122)

Number Percent

- 10 8.2% 1 Yes.
- 25.4 2 We have a plan, but it is not written. (Go to Question 7.)
- 81 66.4 **3** No. (*Go to Question 7.*)

6. If YES, which of the following characterizes your strategic plans for e-government?

(Select all that apply.) (N=10; out of those who answered yes to Q5.)

Number Percent

6

7	70.0%		a. They	describe	the city	's v	vision	for ho	ow e-g	overnment	will	work	and	serve	citizer	ns
---	-------	--	---------	----------	----------	------	--------	--------	--------	-----------	------	------	-----	-------	---------	----

- 6 60.0 b. They are aligned with the city's overall strategic plan or comprehensive plan or business plan.
- 6 60.0 c. They specify which information or services are suitable for electronic delivery.
- 2 20.0 d. They specify which work processes need to change to accommodate on-line service requests.
 - 60.0 e. They consider how citizens might gain access to the Web site, especially for citizens without computers.

7. Before implementing e-government, did your city assess its readiness for e-government in any of the following areas? (*Select all that apply.*) (*N*=123; including those not responding to this question but completing subsequent ones.)

Number Percent

46	37.4%	a. Leadership support needed for e-government
85	69.1	b. Staff competency to plan, develop, and maintain the Web site
80	65.0	c. Availability of computers, technical equipment, and telecommunications capabilities
36	29.3	d. Ability to assess citizen expectations for e-government
80	65.0	e. Funding for equipment and staff
39	31.7	f. Legal issues, such as copyrights or protecting privacy of on-line data
3	2.4	g. Other (<i>Please specify</i> .)

8. Did your city plan how it would implement e-government, once it decided to proceed? (Select one answer.) (N=123)

Number Percent

- 13 10.6% 1 Yes, we had written plans.
- 43.1 2 We planned implementation, but did not write it down. (*Go to Question 10.*)
- 57 46.3 <u>3</u> No. (*Go to Question 10.*)

9. If YES, which of the following did your implementation plans contain? (*Select all that apply.*) (*N*=13; out of those who answered yes to Q8.)

Number Percent a. A description of the on-line initiatives to be undertaken 84.6% 11 12 92.3 b An economic analysis of the initiatives' costs c. Identification of staff resources 13 100.0 d. Proposed funding sources 10 76.9 e. Marketing plans for the e-government services 7 53.8 f. A schedule for implementation 13 100.0 5 g. Customer relations activities to support and respond to users' questions and problems 38.5 3 h. An assessment of changes needed to your business processes 23.1 0 0.0 i. Other (*Please describe*.)

^{7 70.0} f. They are reviewed and updated on a regular basis.

		Have a <u>Written Policy</u>	Certain Practices Are Followed, But <u>Are Unwritten</u>	No Policy Has Yet <u>Been Set</u>
a.	Purpose of Web use in city business (<i>N</i> =121)	<i>N</i> =27; 22.3%	<i>N</i> =45; 37.2%	<i>N</i> =49; 40.5%
b.	Appropriate staff use of the Web (N=122)	<i>N</i> =48; 39.3%	<i>N</i> =35; 28.7%	<i>N</i> =39; 32.0%
c.	Public access to records (N=122)	<i>N</i> =35; 28.7%	<i>N</i> =36; 29.5%	<i>N</i> =51; 41.8%
d.	Privacy of data (N=122)	<i>N</i> =43; 35.2%	<i>N</i> =42; 34.4%	<i>N</i> =37; 30.3%
e.	Security of network resources (N=122)	<i>N</i> =15; 12.3%	<i>N</i> =56; 45.9%	<i>N</i> =51; 41.8%
f.	Records management and storage (N=122)	<i>N</i> =29; 23.8%	<i>N</i> =49; 40.2%	<i>N</i> =44; 36.1%
g.	Marketing Web site to the larger community (N=121)	<i>N</i> =1; 0.8%	<i>N</i> =34; 28.1%	<i>N</i> =86; 71.1%

10. Has your city developed policies for any of the following? (Select one for each row.)

11. How successful has your city been in attempting the following? (Select one for each row.)

	5	<u>Successful</u>	Somewhat Successful		<u>Unsuccessful</u>	Has Not Been <u>Attempted</u>
a.	Seeking support for e-government from top elected and administrative officials (<i>N</i> =122)	<i>N</i> =63 51.6%	<i>N</i> =37 30.3%	<i>N</i> =3 2.5%	<i>N</i> =2 1.6%	<i>N</i> =17 13.9%
b.	Seeking citizen input through a public approval process, e.g., public hearing (<i>N</i> =121)	<i>N</i> =8 6.6%	<i>N</i> =13 10.7%	<i>N</i> =6 5.0%	<i>N</i> =3 2.5%	<i>N</i> =91 75.2%
c.	Identifying potential users and their needs and desires to make the Web site "citizen-oriented" (<i>N</i> =122)	<i>N</i> =17 13.9%	<i>N</i> =41 33.6%	<i>N</i> =13 10.7%	<i>N</i> =2 1.6%	<i>N</i> =49 40.2%
d.	Assigning e-government responsibility to a specific project manager or department (<i>N</i> =12 ⁻	<i>N</i> =41 1) ^{33.9%}	<i>N</i> =46 38.0%	<i>N</i> =7 5.8%	<i>N</i> =3 2.5%	<i>N</i> =24 19.8%
e.	Promoting staff awareness of e-government as a means of conducting day-to-day business (<i>N</i> =121)	<i>N</i> =15 12.4%	<i>N</i> =48 39.7%	<i>N</i> =15 12.4%	<i>N</i> =4 3.3%	N=39 32.2%
f.	Using staff from multiple departments to coordinate the e-government effort (<i>N</i> =121)	<i>N</i> =16 13.2%	<i>N</i> =43 35.5%	<i>N</i> =12 9.9%	<i>N</i> =7 5.8%	<i>N</i> =43 35.5%

12. To the best of your knowledge, how adequate is the infrastructure now available to support your Web site? (Infrastructure includes cabling, telecommunication protocols, hardware standards, high-speed access, etc.) (Select one.) (N=120)

Adequate	Somewhat Adequate	Somewhat Inadequate	Inadequate	Don't Know
<i>N</i> =59; 49.2%	<i>N</i> =36; 30.0%	<i>N</i> =13; 10.8%	<i>N</i> =12; 10.0%	<i>N</i> =0; 0.0%

12(a). Comments: _____

4

ina	icate with whom you worked, if anyone.)	(<i>N</i> =107) For Planning <u>E-Government</u>	(<i>N</i> =107) For Implementing _E-Government	(<i>N</i> =105) For Maintaining <u>E-Government</u>
a.	Independently	<i>N</i> =47; 43.9%	<i>N</i> =38; 35.5%	<i>N</i> =47; 44.8%
b.	With a nearby city(ies)	<i>N</i> =6; 5.6%	<i>N</i> =5; 4.7%	<i>N</i> =4; 3.8%
c.	With a nearby school district(s)	<i>N</i> =6; 5.6%	<i>N</i> =6; 5.6%	<i>N</i> =6; 5.7%
d.	With a nearby county(ies)	<i>N</i> =4; 3.7%	<i>N</i> =1; 0.9%	<i>N</i> =0; 0.0%
e.	With the local library	<i>N</i> =3; 2.8%	<i>N</i> =3; 2.8%	<i>N</i> =2; 1.9%
f.	With a community or technical college or university	<i>N</i> =1; 0.9%	<i>N</i> =2; 1.9%	<i>N</i> =1; 1.0%
g.	With businesses, consultants, or nonprofits	<i>N</i> =48; 44.9%	<i>N</i> =53; 49.5%	<i>N</i> =38; 36.2%
h.	Other (<i>Please specify</i> .)	<i>N</i> =14; 13.1%	<i>N</i> =12; 11.2%	<i>N</i> =14; 13.3%

13. In undertaking e-government, did your city work independently or with others? (*For each column, indicate with whom you worked, if anyone.*)

14. When planning for e-government, did your city estimate expenses using "life-cycle" costs? (Life-cycle costs look at expected use, maintenance, energy, training, and disposal costs over the life of the item as well as the initial purchase price.) (For each row, indicate the cost considerations that were made.)

		Not Included <u>as a Cost</u>	Estimated Only the Initial <u>Purchase Price</u>	Estimated Using Life- Cycle Costs
a.	Research and development (N=116)	<i>N</i> =65; 56.0%	<i>N</i> =40; 34.5%	<i>N</i> =11; 9.5%
b.	Hardware and software (N=117)	<i>N</i> =37; 31.6%	<i>N</i> =55; 47.0%	<i>N</i> =25; 21.4%
c.	Infrastructure (cabling, telecommunication lines, etc.) (N=116)	<i>N</i> =48; 41.4%	<i>N</i> =51; 44.0%	<i>N</i> =17; 14.7%
d.	Contracts with Internet service providers (N=115)	<i>N</i> =26; 22.6%	<i>N</i> =55; 47.8%	<i>N</i> =34; 29.6%
e.	Staff time for technical work and Web page content (<i>N</i> =116)	<i>N</i> =56; 48.3%	<i>N</i> =35; 30.2%	<i>N</i> =25; 21.6%
f.	Staff time for maintaining the Web site (N=116)	<i>N</i> =60; 51.7%	<i>N</i> =26; 22.4%	<i>N</i> =30; 25.9%
g.	Likely overtime pay (N=116)	<i>N</i> =96; 82.8%	<i>N</i> =15; 12.9%	<i>N</i> =5; 4.3%
h.	Opportunity costs for staff time (<i>N</i> =113)	<i>N</i> =92; 81.4%	<i>N</i> =14; 12.4%	<i>N</i> =7; 6.2%
i.	Ongoing maintenance and software updates (<i>N</i> =115)	<i>N</i> =43; 37.4%	<i>N</i> =38; 33.0%	<i>N</i> =34; 29.6%

15. How does your city pay for setting up and running your Web site? (Select one for each row.)

		Use Exclusively	Use in Part	Have Not Used
a.	General fund or other local tax dollars (N=120)	<i>N</i> =69; 57.5%	<i>N</i> =42; 35.0%	<i>N</i> =9; 7.5%
b.	Capital-improvement program dollars (N=83)	<i>N</i> =0; 0.0%	<i>N</i> =28; 33.7%	<i>N</i> =55; 66.3%
c.	User fees (N=81)	<i>N</i> =1; 1.2%	<i>N</i> =8; 9.9%	<i>N</i> =72; 88.9%
d.	Partnerships with other entities (N=81)	<i>N</i> =1; 1.2%	<i>N</i> =17; 21.0%	<i>N</i> =63; 77.8%
e.	Philanthropic grants (N=79)	<i>N</i> =1; 1.3%	<i>N</i> =5; 6.3%	<i>N</i> =73; 92.4%
f.	Advertising revenue (N=79)	<i>N</i> =0; 0.0%	<i>N</i> =4; 5.1%	<i>N</i> =75; 94.9%
g.	State or federal assistance (including grants) (N=78)	<i>N</i> =1; 1.3%	<i>N</i> =3; 3.8%	<i>N</i> =74; 94.9%
h.	Other (Please specify.) (N=23)	<i>N</i> =4; 17.4%	<i>N</i> =4; 17.4%	<i>N</i> =15; 65.2%

Now we would like to ask you about the development and design of your Web site.

16. What steps did your city follow in developing your Web site? (Select all that apply.)

(*N*=123; including those not responding to this question but completing subsequent ones.) <u>Number</u> <u>Percent</u>

85	69.1%	a. Defined the likely target audience for the site
26	21.1	b. Surveyed potential users about their information needs
51	41.5	c. Developed lists of users' likely on-line needs
33	26.8	d. Relied on user information in making design decisions
11	8.9	e. Observed users as they performed tasks using the Web site and solicited their feedback
13	10.6	f. Conducted usability tests of the site to evaluate its structure, content, presentation, or interface

17. How would you describe the extent of the current content of your Web site? (Select all that apply.)

(N=123; including those not responding to this question but completing subsequent ones.)

118	95.9%	a. Provides information describing your city and its operations
56	45.5	b. Provides forms that may be printed and mailed (e.g., employment applications, permit renewals)
48	39.0%	c. Offers a means to submit information on-line (e.g., service requests, citizen polls, registration
		information)
10	8.1	d. Offers a means to complete financial transactions on-line (e.g., pay fees)
12	9.8	e. Other (<i>Please specify</i> .)

18. Indicate which features are part of your current Web site. (Select all that apply.)

10.	mulcate	which leatures are part of your current web site. (Select all that apply.)
	(<i>N</i> =122;	includnig those not responding to this question but completing subsequent ones.)
Numbe	er Percent	
93	76.2%	a. Consistent use of headers, fonts, and backgrounds from page to page
113	92.6	b. Use of plain English instead of technical jargon
47	38.5	c. Text-only or low-graphics options to allow fast loading of Web pages
89	73.0	d. Identification of your city on each Web page
35	28.7	e. Date stamps to indicate the most recent revisions of information
104	85.2	f. Contact names, addresses, e-mail addresses, and telephone numbers displayed prominently
34	27.9	g. A page of "frequently asked questions"
45	36.9	h. Information on how to answer questions not covered on-line
85	69.7	i. Clearly labeled navigation buttons used consistently across pages to return users to specific pages
79	64.8	j. E-mail links to useful resources both inside the city and external to it
47	38.5	k. An index or search function
27	22.1	1. Automated tracking of the times users access various pages or download documents

19. Has your city developed policies that govern what information will be collected from visitors to the Web site? (*Select one.*) (*N*=118)

Number Percent

- 5 4.2% 1 Yes.
- 13 11.0 2 We follow certain privacy practices, but they are unwritten. (Go to Question 21.)
- 100 84.7 <u>3</u> No. (*Go to Question 21.*)

20. Which of the following applies to your city's privacy policies? (Select all that apply.) (*N*=5; out of those who responded yes to Q19.)

Number Percent

1

1

- 3 60.0% a. They specify what data are to be collected from Web-site users.
- 2 40.0 b. They state who are the potential recipients of the data.
- 3 60.0 c. They specify the intended uses of the information.
- 3 60.0 d. They detail the steps taken to protect the data's confidentiality.
- 3 60.0 e. They appear in a conspicuous place on the Web page near where the data are actually collected.
 - 20.0 f. They give users a choice about use of their personal information for secondary purposes (e.g., being

placed on a mailing list or being transferred to a third party).

- 20.0 g. They provide users a means to review information collected on-line.
- 2 40.0 h. They provide users a means to correct data that are inaccurate.
- 0 0.0 i. The Web site displays a privacy seal indicating third-party approval of privacy practices.

21. Does your Web site provide for users who do not speak English or who have physical disabilities? (Select one response for each row.)

(12.1	·····	Yes	No	Users Do <u>Not Need</u>	Don't <u>Know</u>
a.	Site provides an alternative language feature (<i>N</i> =120)	<i>N</i> =2 1.7%	<i>N</i> =105 87.5%	<i>N</i> =1 0.8%	<i>N</i> =12 10.0%
b.	Site complies with federal or state guidelines on accessibility $(N=119)$	<i>N</i> =11 9.2%	<i>N</i> =26 21.8%	<i>N</i> =1 0.8%	<i>N</i> =81 68.1%

22. Which security measures, if any, has your city taken for its Web site? (Select one for each row.)

	hen security measures, if any, has your enty taken				0	,
		Done Fully	Done <u>Partially</u>	Not <u>Done</u>	Not <u>Applicable</u>	Don't <u>Know</u>
ι.	Conducted risk assessment of Web site data security (<i>N</i> =115)	<i>N</i> =17 14.8%	<i>N</i> =14 12.2%	<i>N</i> =41 35.7%	<i>N</i> =17 14.8%	<i>N</i> =26 22.6%
)*.	Wrote security policies and procedures based on results of risk assessment (<i>N</i> =116)	<i>N</i> =6 5.2%	<i>N</i> =7 6.0%	<i>N</i> =63 54.3%	<i>N</i> =20 17.2%	<i>N</i> =19 16.4%
•	Installed and tested firewall(s) (<i>N</i> =117)	<i>N</i> =48 41.0%	<i>N</i> =7 6.0%	<i>N</i> =23 19.7%	<i>N</i> =15 12.8%	<i>N</i> =24 20.5%
•	Installed current security patches (<i>N</i> =115)	<i>N</i> =38 33.0%	<i>N</i> =11 9.6%	<i>N</i> =19 16.5%	<i>N</i> =15` 13.0%	<i>N</i> =32 27.8%
•	Used current anti-virus programs (<i>N</i> =115)	<i>N</i> =67 58.3%	<i>N</i> =10 8.7%	<i>N</i> =9 7.8%	<i>N</i> =13 11.3%	<i>N</i> =16 13.9%
	Developed plans for data backups and disaster recovery (<i>N</i> =117)	<i>N</i> =47 40.2%	<i>N</i> =24 20.5%	<i>N</i> =19 16.2%	<i>N</i> =12 10.3%	<i>N</i> =15 12.8%
•	Granted employee data access on "need-to-know" basis (<i>N</i> =116)	<i>N</i> =28 24.1%	<i>N</i> =12 10.3%	<i>N</i> =24 20.7%	N=32 27.6%	<i>N</i> =20 17.2%
•	Changed security clearances when employees turned over $(N=115)$	<i>N</i> =32 27.8%	<i>N</i> =6 5.2%	<i>N</i> =23 20.0%	<i>N</i> =38 33.0%	<i>N</i> =16 13.9%
	Required periodic password changes (<i>N</i> =114)	<i>N</i> =16 14.0%	<i>N</i> =15 13.2%	<i>N</i> =49 43.0%	<i>N</i> =17 14.9%	<i>N</i> =17 14.9%
	Separated servers for Web site and other functions (<i>N</i> =118)	<i>N</i> =52 44.1%	<i>N</i> =5 4.2%	<i>N</i> =21 17.8%	<i>N</i> =23 19.5%	<i>N</i> =17 14.4%
	Internally controlled who changes the Web site and when $(N=116)$	<i>N</i> =74 63.8%	<i>N</i> =12 10.3%	<i>N</i> =10 8.6%	<i>N</i> =9 7.8%	<i>N</i> =11 9.5%
	Periodically reviewed security system's adequacy (<i>N</i> =114)	<i>N</i> =25 21.9%	<i>N</i> =22 19.3%	<i>N</i> =33 28.9%	<i>N</i> =14 12.3%	<i>N</i> =20 17.5
	*Have security policy, but not risk assessment	<i>N</i> =1 0.9%				

23. How much nonpublic data do you maintain on any servers in connection with your Web site? (Select one.) (N=118)

Number Percent

3 2.5% 1 Large amounts

9 7.6 2 Moderate amounts

96 81.4 3 Very little, if any

10 8.5 4 Don't know

24. Has your government taken any of the following security steps to protect your site's data?

(Select one for each row.)

		Done Fully	Done <u>Partially</u>	Not <u>Done</u>	Not <u>Applicable</u>	Don't <u>Know</u>
a.	Trained employees on importance of securing data $(N=113)$	<i>N</i> =11 9.7%	<i>N</i> =33 29.2%	<i>N</i> =34 30.1%	<i>N</i> =28 24.8%	<i>N</i> =7 6.2%
b.	Besides passwords, required second authentication factor, e.g., smart card or token (<i>N</i> =113)	<i>N</i> =0 0.0%	<i>N</i> =5 4.4%	<i>N</i> =67 59.3%	<i>N</i> =33 29.2%	<i>N</i> =8 7.1%
c.	Assigned responsibility for ongoing security monitoring to trained employees or consultants $(N=112)$	<i>N</i> =20 17.9%	<i>N</i> =21 18.8%	<i>N</i> =36 32.1%	<i>N</i> =28 25.0%	<i>N</i> =7 6.3%
d.	Restricted physical access to data centers (<i>N</i> =113)	<i>N</i> =35 31.0%	<i>N</i> =22 19.5%	<i>N</i> =17 15.0%	N=29 25.7%	<i>N</i> =10 8.8%
e.	Prepared incident-response procedures for possible incidents (<i>N</i> =113)	<i>N</i> =7 6.2%	<i>N</i> =12 10.6%	<i>N</i> =54 47.8%	N=29 25.7%	<i>N</i> =11 9.7%
f.	Encrypted incoming and stored data (<i>N</i> =113)	<i>N</i> =3 2.7%	<i>N</i> =9 8.0%	<i>N</i> =48 42.5%	<i>N</i> =31 27.4%	<i>N</i> =22 19.5%
g.	Disposed of nonpublic data when no longer needed $(N=112)$	<i>N</i> =13 11.6%	<i>N</i> =18 16.1%	<i>N</i> =27 24.1%	<i>N</i> =39 34.8%	<i>N</i> =15 13.4%
h.	Installed intrusion detection software (<i>N</i> =113)	<i>N</i> =11 9.7%	<i>N</i> =8 7.1%	<i>N</i> =41 36.3%	<i>N</i> =27 23.9%	<i>N</i> =26 23.0%
i.	Provided for third-party assessment of security controls (<i>N</i> =113)	<i>N</i> =10 8.8%	<i>N</i> =12 10.6%	<i>N</i> =43 38.1%	N=29 25.7%	<i>N</i> =19 16.8%
j.	Implemented "public key infrastructure" with electronic "keys" to decrypt data (<i>N</i> =113)	<i>N</i> =3 2.7%	<i>N</i> =2 1.8%	<i>N</i> =48 42.5%	<i>N</i> =35 31.0%	<i>N</i> =25 22.1%
k.	Other (Please specify.) (N=23)	<i>N</i> =1 4.3%	<i>N</i> =1 4.3%	<i>N</i> =10 43.5%	<i>N</i> =8 34.8%	<i>N</i> =3 13.0%

25. Which of the following best describes your arrangements for the development, hosting, and day-to-day operations of your Web site? (For each column select all that apply.)

			/	
		(<i>N</i> =114) For <u>Developing</u>	(<i>N</i> =109) For <u>Hosting</u>	(<i>N</i> =116) For Daily <u>Maintenance</u>
a.	We rely on in-house staff.	<i>N</i> =77 67.5%	<i>N</i> =29 26.6%	<i>N</i> =92 79.3%
b.	We rely on a collaboration(s) of local governments.	<i>N</i> =6 5.3%	<i>N</i> =14 12.8%	N=3 2.6%
c.	We use our own computers but rely on a consultant or Web-service vendor(s).	<i>N</i> =29 25.4%	<i>N</i> =31 28.4%	<i>N</i> =17 14.7%
d.	Service is provided off-site by a vendor using off-site equipment.	<i>N</i> =24 21.1%	<i>N</i> =62 56.9%	<i>N</i> =26 22.4%
e.	Other (Please specify.)	<i>N</i> =0 0.0%	<i>N</i> =0 0.0%	N=0 0.0%

The next set of questions applies to the *ongoing operations* of your city's Web site.

26. Does your city have a written plan describing procedures and a schedule for Web site upkeep? (*N*=119)

Number Percent

- 5 4.2% 1 Yes.
- 45 37.8 2 We have a plan but it is not written.
- 69 58.0 3 No.
- 27. If your city has in-house staff who work on e-government, how would you describe the adequacy of the number of staff needed for e-government, their competence, their use of training, and the general quality of the training? (Select one response for each row.)

		Adequate	Somewhat Adequate	Somewhat Inadequate	Inadequate	Not <u>Applicable</u>
a.	Number of staff needed for e-government (<i>N</i> =113)	<i>N</i> =30 26.5%	<i>N</i> =38 33.6%	<i>N</i> =15 13.3%	<i>N</i> =19 16.8%	<i>N</i> =11 9.7%
b.	Staff competence to offer e-government (<i>N</i> =113)	<i>N</i> =25 22.1%	<i>N</i> =47 41.6%	<i>N</i> =13 11.5%	<i>N</i> =17 15.0%	<i>N</i> =11 9.7%
c.	Staff Use of Available Training					
	1. Start-up training (<i>N</i> =109)	<i>N</i> =27 24.8%	<i>N</i> =27 24.8%	<i>N</i> =14 12.8%	N=22 20.2%	<i>N</i> =19 17.4%
	2. Ongoing training (<i>N</i> =108)	<i>N</i> =16 14.8%	<i>N</i> =29 26.9%	<i>N</i> =19 17.6%	<i>N</i> =26 24.1%	<i>N</i> =18 16.7%
d.	Quality of Training					
	1. Start-up training (<i>N</i> =109)	<i>N</i> =26 23.9%	<i>N</i> =27 24.8%	<i>N</i> =17 15.6%	<i>N</i> =17 15.6%	<i>N</i> =22 20.2%
	2. Ongoing training (<i>N</i> =109)	<i>N</i> =17 15.6%	<i>N</i> =31 28.4%	<i>N</i> =20 18.3%	<i>N</i> =20 18.3%	<i>N</i> =21 19.3%

28. For which of the following activities, if any, has your city assigned specific responsibility to either in-house staff or others? (*Select all that apply.*) (*N*=121; including those not responding to this question but completing subsequent ones.)

Number Percent

 93 76.9 b. Regularly reviewing Web pages' content and updating as needed 70 57.9 c. Testing Web pages before releasing them publicly 	
70 57.9 c. Testing Web pages before releasing them publicly	
72 59.5 d. Checking links on the Web page and changing "dead" links	
62.8 e. Responding to Web-generated requests for information or service	
48 39.7 f. Tracking user activity of the site	
22 18.2 g. Actively monitoring the site to identify security breaches	
54 44.6 h. Maintaining updated antivirus software and installing software "patches"	,

29. Has your city evaluated the Web site to determine how well it is meeting your e-government goals? *(Select one answer.)* (*N*=119)

Number Percent

- 27 22.7% 1 Yes.
- 57 47.9 2 No. (*Go to Question 31*.)

35 29.4 3 No, but we plan to within the year. (*Go to Question 31.*)

30. If YES, how satisfied are you that your city's experience with e-government has met your original expectations? (*Select one.*) (*N*=25; out of those who answered yes to Q29.)

	Somewhat	Somewhat		Don't
Satisfied	Satisfied	Unsatisfied	Unsatisfied	Know
<i>N</i> =10; 40.0%	<i>N</i> =10; 40.0%	<i>N</i> =4; 16.0%	<i>N</i> =0; 0.0%	<i>N</i> =1; 4.0%

31. Has your city taken either of the following steps? (For each row select one response.)

		Yes	No	No, But We Plan <u>To Within The Year</u>
a.	Identified measures to determine whether the Web site is cost-effective (<i>N</i> =112)	<i>N</i> =14 12.5%	<i>N</i> =80 71.4%	<i>N</i> =18 16.1%
b.	Reviewed and revised the Web site based on feedback from users (<i>N</i> =113)	<i>N</i> =50 44.2%	<i>N</i> =39 34.5%	<i>N</i> =24 21.2%

Finally, we would like to ask for your comments.

- **32.** What innovative or effective methods has your city used in developing and maintaining e-government?
- 33. Please include any additional comments or concerns. (Use an additional sheet, if needed.)

Thank you for completing this questionnaire!

Please send the completed form in the pre-addressed envelope, or fax it to 651/296-4712, by November 6, 2001.

Office of the Legislative Auditor

Room 140, Centennial Office Building, 658 Cedar Street, St. Paul, MN 55155 651/296-4708